



25th February 2025

Right to Know
requests@righttoknow.ie

Re: AIE request AIE.25.020

Dear Sir/Madam,

I refer to your request for information under the European Communities (Access to Information on the Environment) Regulations 2007 to 2018. You requested the following:

Under the AIE to request:

- 1) Minutes of any Meeting of the Bovine TB Stakeholder Forum in 2024 since Meeting 20 (22 May 2024), together with copies of any presentations circulated at these meetings, and any data/reports provided to farming organisations after the meetings

- 2) Bovine TB Stakeholder Forum – Meeting 20, Date: 22 May 2024
 - a) DAFM Presentation circulated (Disease Trends Update)
 - b) Research Update presentation circulated
 - c) Simon More, UCD critique of the TB eradication programme presentation circulated
 - d) DAFM data provided to farming organisation in response to request for statistics in respect of animals where PCR test carried out
 - e) DAFM data provided to farming organisation request analysis of C10 herds who are now in a breakdown

- 3) Bovine TB Stakeholder Forum – Meeting 19, Date: 27 February 2024
 - a) Minister's response to the letter from the IWG Chairman on the Wildlife Programme
 - b) Summary document of the work of the TB Forum and IWG to date
 - c) Department provided an update on wildlife figures in terms of vaccination, culling and staffing



- d) DAFM presentation - Disease Trends Update The Department presented TB Disease Trends 2022-2024 which examined the increase in rolling totals of TB reactors and restricted herds
- e) ESRI behavioural report findings on Bovine TB
- f) Simon More presented preliminary results on a study "Is badger vaccination, in combination with existing cattle-based controls sufficient to eradicate bTB from Ireland?"

4) Minutes of any Meeting of the Finance Working Group – since Meeting 16, 24th February 2023 together with copies of any presentations circulated at these meetings, and any data/reports provided to farming organisations after the meetings

5) Minutes of the Bovine TB Stakeholder Forum's Implementation Working Group (IWG) – since Meeting 39, 03 September 2024, together with copies of any presentations circulated at these meetings, and any data/reports provided to farming organisations after the meetings

- a) DAFM update on disease situation by county
- b) DAFM data analysis on movement of animals between herds

6) Bovine TB Stakeholder Forum's Implementation Working Group (IWG) – Meeting 38, 02 July 2024

- a) DAFM records on minority herds who do not carry out TB tests and are trade restricted (cannot sell on the open market). It is unclear from minutes if this data was made available to farming organisations and/or IWG members, so please consider this request for the records regardless of whether provided or not, in summary format as aggregated by DAFM for reporting purposes

For context on above please see

<https://www.gov.ie/en/collection/d3baf-tb-forum/>

<https://www.gov.ie/en/collection/217aa-finance-working-group/>



A final decision on your request was made today by the undersigned. I can be contacted by telephone on 01 5058713 or email donal.mooney@agriculture.gov.ie and will seek to answer any questions you may have regarding your request.

Having considered your request, my decision is to refuse you access to the information sought.

In arriving at a decision on your request, I am refusing to disclose the information under Article 9 as follows

1) Minutes of any Meeting of the Bovine TB Stakeholder Forum in 2024 since Meeting 20 (22 May 2024), together with copies of any presentations circulated at these meetings, and any data/reports provided to farming organisations after the meetings

The publication of the most recent Minutes of Meetings of the TB Forum are only published on www.bovinetb.ie after they have been cleared at the next meeting of the relevant group. The latest minutes to be published are Meeting 21 30th October 2024.

Decision to refuse copies of presentations and any data/reports is based on Article 9 as follows:

9. (2) A public authority may refuse to make environmental information available where the request—(c) concerns material in the course of completion, or unfinished documents or data.

9. (2) A public authority may refuse to make environmental information available where the request—(d) concerns internal communications of public authorities, taking into account the public interest served by the disclosure.

2) Bovine TB Stakeholder Forum – Meeting 20, Date: 22 May 2024

a) DAFM Presentation circulated (Disease Trends Update)

b) Research Update presentation circulated

c) Simon More, UCD critique of the TB eradication programme presentation circulated

d) DAFM data provided to farming organisation in response to request for statistics in respect of animals where PCR test carried out

e) DAFM data provided to farming organisation request analysis of C10 herds who are now in a breakdown



Decision to refuse copies of presentations and any data/reports is based on Article 9 as follows:

9. (2) A public authority may refuse to make environmental information available where the request—(c) concerns material in the course of completion, or unfinished documents or data.

9. (2) A public authority may refuse to make environmental information available where the request—(d) concerns internal communications of public authorities, taking into account the public interest served by the disclosure.

3) Bovine TB Stakeholder Forum – Meeting 19, Date: 27 February 2024

- a) Minister's response to the letter from the IWG Chairman on the Wildlife Programme
- b) Summary document of the work of the TB Forum and IWG to date
- c) Department provided an update on wildlife figures in terms of vaccination, culling and staffing
- d) DAFM presentation - Disease Trends Update The Department presented TB Disease Trends 2022-2024 which examined the increase in rolling totals of TB reactors and restricted herds
- e) ESRI behavioural report findings on Bovine TB
- f) Simon More presented preliminary results on a study "Is badger vaccination, in combination with existing cattle-based controls sufficient to eradicate bTB from Ireland?"

Decision to refuse copies of letter, summary of documents, presentations and any data/reports is based on Article 9 as follows:

9. (2) A public authority may refuse to make environmental information available where the request—(c) concerns material in the course of completion, or unfinished documents or data.

9. (2) A public authority may refuse to make environmental information available where the request—(d) concerns internal communications of public authorities, taking into account the public interest served by the disclosure.

4) Minutes of any Meeting of the Finance Working Group – since Meeting 16, 24th February 2023 together with copies of any presentations circulated at these meetings, and any data/reports provided to farming organisations after the meetings.



Your request in respect of the Finance Working Group is being considered by the section responsible for that work who will issue a separate reply.

5) Minutes of the Bovine TB Stakeholder Forum's Implementation Working Group (IWG) – since Meeting 39, 03 September 2024, together with copies of any presentations circulated at these meetings, and any data/reports provided to farming organisations after the meetings

- a) DAFM update on disease situation by county
- b) DAFM data analysis on movement of animals between herds

The publication of the most recent Minutes of Meetings of the Implementation Working Group (IWG) are only published on www.bovinetb.ie after they have been cleared at the next meeting of the relevant group. The latest minutes to be published are Meeting 40 2nd October 2024.

Decision to refuse copies of presentations and any data/reports is based on Article 9 as follows:

9. (2) A public authority may refuse to make environmental information available where the request—(c) concerns material in the course of completion, or unfinished documents or data.

9. (2) A public authority may refuse to make environmental information available where the request—(d) concerns internal communications of public authorities, taking into account the public interest served by the disclosure.

6) Bovine TB Stakeholder Forum's Implementation Working Group (IWG) – Meeting 38, 02 July 2024

a) DAFM records on minority herds who do not carry out TB tests and are trade restricted (cannot sell on the open market). It is unclear from minutes if this data was made available to farming organisations and/or IWG members, so please consider this request for the records regardless of whether provided or not, in summary format as aggregated by DAFM for reporting purposes

Decision to refuse copies of presentations and any data/reports is based on Article 9 as follows:

9. (2) A public authority may refuse to make environmental information available where the request—(c) concerns material in the course of completion, or unfinished documents or data.



9. (2) A public authority may refuse to make environmental information available where the request—(d) concerns internal communications of public authorities, taking into account the public interest served by the disclosure.

If for any reason you wish to appeal this decision you may do so by writing to the Freedom of Information Unit at the Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine, Pavilion A, Grattan Business Centre, Dublin Road, Portlaoise, Co. Laois, R32 K857. You may also submit your appeal by e-mail to: foi@agriculture.gov.ie. You must make your appeal within one month of this notification.

Yours sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Donal Mooney". The signature is fluid and cursive, with "Donal" on the first line and "Mooney" on the second line.

Donal Mooney
Higher Executive Officer
Ruminant Animal Health Division