

**From:** [Boyce, Catherine](#)  
**To:** [OFahy, Emmet](#)  
**Subject:** FW: New AA LM01-FL0011 PRIORITY, Customer Charter IMMEDIATE RESPONSE REQUIRED  
**Date:** Monday 16 January 2023 10:34:00

---

-----Original Message-----

From: Felling Forest Service <[Felling.ForestService@agriculture.gov.ie](mailto:Felling.ForestService@agriculture.gov.ie)>  
Sent: Monday 16 January 2023 10:30  
To: Boyce, Catherine <[Catherine.Boyce@agriculture.gov.ie](mailto:Catherine.Boyce@agriculture.gov.ie)>  
Subject: FW: New AA LM01-FL0011 PRIORITY, Customer Charter IMMEDIATE RESPONSE REQUIRED

-----Original Message-----

From: [REDACTED]  
Sent: Monday 16 January 2023 08:05  
To: Dunne, Seamus <[Seamus.Dunne@agriculture.gov.ie](mailto:Seamus.Dunne@agriculture.gov.ie)>  
Cc: Hayes, Colm <[Colm.Hayes@agriculture.gov.ie](mailto:Colm.Hayes@agriculture.gov.ie)>; Bucke, Ken <[Ken.Bucke@agriculture.gov.ie](mailto:Ken.Bucke@agriculture.gov.ie)>; Fahy, Orla <[Orla.Fahy@agriculture.gov.ie](mailto:Orla.Fahy@agriculture.gov.ie)>; Hona, Seppi <[Seppi.Hona@agriculture.gov.ie](mailto:Seppi.Hona@agriculture.gov.ie)>; Dunbar, Anthony <[Anthony.Dunbar@agriculture.gov.ie](mailto:Anthony.Dunbar@agriculture.gov.ie)>; Felling Forest Service <[Felling.ForestService@agriculture.gov.ie](mailto:Felling.ForestService@agriculture.gov.ie)>; Coggins, Karl <[Karl.Coggins@agriculture.gov.ie](mailto:Karl.Coggins@agriculture.gov.ie)>; OConnell, Eilis <[eilis.oconnell@agriculture.gov.ie](mailto:eilis.oconnell@agriculture.gov.ie)>; [REDACTED]; [REDACTED]; Hackett, Minister <[Minister.Hackett@agriculture.gov.ie](mailto:Minister.Hackett@agriculture.gov.ie)>; Connaire, Daniel <[Daniel.Connaire@agriculture.gov.ie](mailto:Daniel.Connaire@agriculture.gov.ie)>; Forestry Support Unit <[FSU@agriculture.gov.ie](mailto:FSU@agriculture.gov.ie)>  
Subject: RE: New AA LM01-FL0011 PRIORITY, Customer Charter IMMEDIATE RESPONSE REQUIRED

CAUTION: This Email originated from Outside of this department. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe. Otherwise Please Forward any suspicious Emails to [Notify.Cyber@agriculture.gov.ie](mailto:Notify.Cyber@agriculture.gov.ie) .

Mr Dunne,

It would appear that the relevant staff of your Department (FSU and local Inspectorate) are unwilling to address my queries in respect of the works under this licence.

I would like responses to what I consider to be a reasonable set of questions regarding this matter.

Can you please respond to my queries regarding this licence.

Can you confirm whether a DAFM ecologist has visited the site since the incident was reported.

Can you confirm if DAFM has had sight of Coillte's Contingency Plan?

Can you indicate whether the authority for the relevant Natura 2000 sites has been notified of the events at Crumpane?

Was an AA conducted for the mitigation works carried out in relation to the incident?

The public is entitled to understand how the FS, as the enforcement authority is dealing with this case.

[REDACTED]

-----Original Message-----

From: [REDACTED]  
Sent: 06 January 2023 08:17  
To: 'Dunne, Seamus'  
Cc: 'Hayes, Colm'; 'Bucke, Ken'; 'Fahy, Orla'; 'Hona, Seppi'; 'Dunbar, Anthony'; 'Felling Forest Service';

'Coggins, Karl'; 'OConnell, Eilis'; [REDACTED] 'Minister Hackett'; 'Connaire, Daniel'; 'Forestry Support Unit'  
Subject: RE: New AA LM01-FL0011 PRIORITY, Customer Charter IMMEDIATE RESPONSE REQUIRED

Mr Dunne,

It would appear that the staff of your Department (FSU and local Inspectorate) are unwilling to address my queries in respect of the works under this licence.

I would like responses to what I consider to be a reasonable set of questions regarding this matter.

Can you please respond to my queries regarding this licence.

Can you confirm whether a DAFM ecologist has visited the site since the incident was reported.

Can you confirm if DAFM has had sight of Coillte's Contingency Plan?

Can you indicate whether the authority for the relevant Natura 2000 sites has been notified of the events at Crumpane?

Can you confirm whether the suspended licence has been re-instated / re-activated?

Was an AA conducted for the mitigation works carried out in relation to the incident?

[REDACTED]

-----Original Message-----

From: [REDACTED]  
Sent: 05 January 2023 08:16  
To: 'Forestry Support Unit'; 'Connaire, Daniel'  
Cc: 'Hayes, Colm'; 'Bucke, Ken'; 'Fahy, Orla'; 'Hona, Seppi'; 'Dunbar, Anthony'; 'Felling Forest Service'; 'Coggins, Karl'; 'OConnell, Eilis'; [REDACTED] 'Minister Hackett'  
Subject: RE: New AA LM01-FL0011 PRIORITY, Customer Charter IMMEDIATE RESPONSE REQUIRED

Forestry Support Unit, Mr Connaire,

Can you please respond to my queries regarding this licence.

Can you confirm whether a DAFM ecologist has visited the site since the incident was reported.

Can you confirm if DAFM has had sight of Coillte's Contingency Plan?

Can you indicate whether the authority for the relevant Natura 2000 sites has been notified of the events at Crumpane?

Can you confirm whether the suspended licence has been re-instated / re-activated?

Was an AA conducted for the mitigation works carried out in relation to the incident?

[REDACTED]

-----Original Message-----

From: [REDACTED]  
Sent: 04 January 2023 09:03  
To: 'Forestry Support Unit'; 'Connaire, Daniel'  
Cc: 'Hayes, Colm'; 'Bucke, Ken'; 'Fahy, Orla'; 'Hona, Seppi'; 'Dunbar, Anthony'; 'Felling Forest Service'; 'Coggins, Karl'; 'OConnell, Eilis'; [REDACTED] 'Minister Hackett'  
Subject: RE: New AA LM01-FL0011 PRIORITY, Customer Charter IMMEDIATE RESPONSE REQUIRED

Mr O'Donnell,

These emails will be coming to you daily until I receive a response.

With reference to the Department's Customer Charter;

Can you please respond to the following queries which you have omitted to address in your reply:

Can you confirm whether a DAFM ecologist has visited the site since the incident was reported.

Can you confirm if DAFM has had sight of Coillte's Contingency Plan?

In addition, can you also indicate whether the authority for the relevant Natura 2000 sites has been notified of the events at Crumpane?

Can you confirm whether the suspended licence has been re-instated / re-activated?

I note that the Inspector's Statement of Evidence includes "The Appropriate Assessment Determination (AAD) contains a large number of water related mitigations".

I would like to see a copy of the AA that was conducted to underpin the mitigation works that were undertaken on the site which would not have been covered by the original AA.

The mitigation works carried out on site have altered the project area and as such I am strongly of the view that a new AA is required before the licence can be re-issued.

The Inspector's Statement would indicate that there are likely to be ongoing problems with this site due to the need for a forest road extension.

It would appear that the Department's approach is merely to insist on Coillte doing what it should have done in the first place.

There does not appear to be any form of deterrent to prevent a similar incident happening again. The Department is giving forestry operators a free bet to cut corners with environmental protection.

This lax attitude to enforcement is not covered in the SEA Environmental Report.

Coillte did not report the incident. DAFM did not detect the incident. But for the vigilance of the public and then Leitrim County Council this incident could have gone unrecorded.

Coillte's failure to report the incident is, to my mind, a most serious transgression and one which must not be over-looked by DAFM.

[REDACTED]

-----Original Message-----

From: [REDACTED]  
Sent: 03 January 2023 08:04  
To: 'Forestry Support Unit'  
Cc: 'Hayes, Colm'; 'Bucke, Ken'; 'Fahy, Orla'; 'Connaire, Daniel'; 'Hona, Seppi'; 'Dunbar, Anthony'; 'Felling Forest Service'; [REDACTED] 'Coggins, Karl'; 'OConnell, Eilis'  
Subject: RE: New AA LM01-FL0011 PRIORITY, Customer Charter

Mr O'Donnell,

With reference to the Department's Customer Charter;

Can you please respond to the following queries which you have omitted to address in your reply:

Can you confirm whether a DAFM ecologist has visited the site since the incident was reported.

Can you confirm if DAFM has had sight of Coillte's Contingency Plan?

In addition, can you also indicate whether the authority for the relevant Natura 2000 sites has been notified of the events at Crumpane?

Can you confirm whether the suspended licence has been re-instated / re-activated?

[REDACTED]

-----Original Message-----

From: [REDACTED] <[REDACTED].com>

Sent: 28 December 2022 09:26

To: 'Forestry Support Unit'

Cc: 'Hayes, Colm'; 'Bucke, Ken'; 'Fahy, Orla'; 'Connaire, Daniel'; 'Hona, Seppi'; 'Dunbar, Anthony'; 'Felling Forest Service'; [REDACTED] 'Coggins, Karl'; 'OConnell, Eilis'

Subject: RE: New AA LM01-FL0011 PRIORITY, Customer Charter

Mr O'Donnell,

With reference to the Department's Customer Charter;

Can you please respond to the following queries which you have omitted to address in your reply:

Can you confirm whether a DAFM ecologist has visited the site since the incident was reported.

Can you confirm if DAFM has had sight of Coillte's Contingency Plan?

In addition, can you also indicate whether the authority for the relevant Natura 2000 sites has been notified of the events at Crumpane?

Can you confirm whether the suspended licence has been re-instated / re-activated?

[REDACTED]

-----Original Message-----

From: [REDACTED]

Sent: 20 December 2022 08:08

To: 'Forestry Support Unit'

Cc: 'Hayes, Colm'; 'Bucke, Ken'; 'Fahy, Orla'; 'Connaire, Daniel'; 'Hona, Seppi'; 'Dunbar, Anthony'; 'Felling Forest Service'; [REDACTED] 'Coggins, Karl'; 'OConnell, Eilis'

Subject: RE: New AA LM01-FL0011 PRIORITY

Mr O'Donnell,

Can you please respond to the following queries which you have omitted to address in your reply:

Can you confirm whether a DAFM ecologist has visited the site since the incident was reported.

Can you confirm if DAFM has had sight of Coillte's Contingency Plan?

In addition, can you also indicate whether the authority for the relevant Natura 2000 sites has been notified of the events at Crumpane?

Can you confirm whether the suspended licence has been re-instated / re-activated?

[REDACTED]

-----Original Message-----

From: [REDACTED]

Sent: 12 December 2022 08:23

To: 'Forestry Support Unit'

Cc: 'Hayes, Colm'; 'Bucke, Ken'; 'Fahy, Orla'; 'Connaire, Daniel'; 'Hona, Seppi'; 'Dunbar, Anthony'; 'Felling

Forest Service'; [REDACTED] 'Coggins, Karl'; 'OConnell, Eilis'  
Subject: RE: New AA LM01-FL0011

Mr O'Donnell,

Can you please respond to the following queries which you have omitted to address in your reply:

Can you confirm whether a DAFM ecologist has visited the site since the incident was reported.

Can you confirm if DAFM has had sight of Coillte's Contingency Plan?

In addition, can you also indicate whether the authority for the relevant Natura 2000 sites has been notified of the events at Crumpane?

Can you confirm whether the suspended licence has been re-instated / re-activated?

[REDACTED]

-----Original Message-----

From: [REDACTED]  
Sent: 06 December 2022 08:20  
To: 'Forestry Support Unit'  
Cc: 'Hayes, Colm'; 'Bucke, Ken'; 'Fahy, Orla'; 'Connaire, Daniel'; 'Hona, Seppi'; 'Dunbar, Anthony'; 'Felling Forest Service'; [REDACTED] 'Coggins, Karl'  
Subject: RE: New AA LM01-FL0011

-----Original Message-----

From: [REDACTED]  
Sent: 29 November 2022 08:21  
To: 'Forestry Support Unit'  
Cc: 'Hayes, Colm'; 'Bucke, Ken'; 'Fahy, Orla'; 'Connaire, Daniel'; 'Hona, Seppi'; 'Dunbar, Anthony'; 'Felling Forest Service'; [REDACTED] 'Coggins, Karl'  
Subject: RE: New AA LM01-FL0011

Mr O'Donnell,

The Inspector's Conclusions and Recommendations are as follows:

1. Suspension of licence with immediate effect.
2. Review licence.
3. Communicate issues and request remedial action plan from Coillte.
4. Immediate emergency remedial works to take place on site to stabilise silt, install silt curtains and renew temporary log bridging points. (These actions have been ongoing since the 17th of October in liaison with Leitrim County Council environmental team)
5. Additional silt traps to be placed intermittently in relevant water courses to act as settlement areas and slow water dams.
6. Inland Fisheries and Leitrim County Council should be consulted due to siltation runoff from the site.
7. Additional site monitoring and record keeping during operations to be required from Coillte.

There is no Recommendation to re-instate the licence, only to review it

The Inspector's Statement of Evidence states

"The Appropriate Assessment Determination (AAD) contains a large number of water related mitigations". The remedial works (including additional silt traps) nullify the original AA as the impact of these works on the Natura Sites has not been considered in reaching a Determination. It must be considered that the original AA was defective or additional silt traps would not be required.

Can you please respond to the following queries which you have omitted to address in your reply:

Can you confirm whether a DAFM ecologist has visited the site since the incident was reported.

Can you confirm if DAFM has had sight of Coillte's Contingency Plan?

In addition, can you also indicate whether the authority for the relevant Natura 2000 sites has been notified of the events at Crumpane?

-----Original Message-----

From: Forestry Support Unit [<mailto:FSU@agriculture.gov.ie>]

Sent: 28 November 2022 15:17

To: [REDACTED]

Cc: Hayes, Colm; Bucke, Ken; Fahy, Orla; Connaire, Daniel; Hona, Seppi; Dunbar, Anthony; Felling Forest Service; [REDACTED] Coggins, Karl; Forestry Support Unit

Subject: RE: New AA LM01-FL0011

Dear [REDACTED]

Given that a review of the incident has already been carried out by a DAFM Inspector and a resumption of operations plan has been prepared by Coillte (following their own review which highlighted the underground water source), a second AA is not considered necessary in this case.

Regards,

Seonaid O'Donnell  
Clerical Officer, Forest Service

—  
An Roinn Talmhaíochta, Bia agus Mara  
Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine

Eastát Chaisleán Bhaile Sheáin, Co. Loch Garman, Y35 PN52

Johnstown Castle Estate, Wexford, Y35 PN52 \_\_

T: 0539163425

[www.agriculture.gov.ie](http://www.agriculture.gov.ie)

-----Original Message-----

From: [REDACTED]

Sent: Monday 28 November 2022 07:39

To: Forestry Support Unit <[FSU@agriculture.gov.ie](mailto:FSU@agriculture.gov.ie)>

Cc: Hayes, Colm <[Colm.Hayes@agriculture.gov.ie](mailto:Colm.Hayes@agriculture.gov.ie)>; Bucke, Ken <[Ken.Bucke@agriculture.gov.ie](mailto:Ken.Bucke@agriculture.gov.ie)>; Fahy, Orla <[Orla.Fahy@agriculture.gov.ie](mailto:Orla.Fahy@agriculture.gov.ie)>; Connaire, Daniel <[Daniel.Connaire@agriculture.gov.ie](mailto:Daniel.Connaire@agriculture.gov.ie)>; Hona, Seppi <[Seppi.Hona@agriculture.gov.ie](mailto:Seppi.Hona@agriculture.gov.ie)>; Dunbar, Anthony <[Anthony.Dunbar@agriculture.gov.ie](mailto:Anthony.Dunbar@agriculture.gov.ie)>; Felling Forest Service <[Felling.ForestService@agriculture.gov.ie](mailto:Felling.ForestService@agriculture.gov.ie)>; [REDACTED] <[REDACTED]>; Coggins, Karl <[Karl.Coggins@agriculture.gov.ie](mailto:Karl.Coggins@agriculture.gov.ie)>

Subject: New AA LM01-FL0011

CAUTION: This Email originated from Outside of this department. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender and know the content is safe. Otherwise Please Forward any suspicious Emails to [Notify.Cyber@agriculture.gov.ie](mailto:Notify.Cyber@agriculture.gov.ie) .

This licence has been suspended due to a water pollution incident as a result of multiple breaches of licence conditions and AA mitigation. I am aware that Coillte is seeking a re-instatement of the licence and that an amended licence has been created and is on file.

The project was subject to an AA for Ben Bulben, Gleniff and Glenade Complex SAC IE0000623: "Possible effect due to the direct hydrological connectivity exists between the project area and this SAC". There is also a direct downstream hydrological connection with Bunduff Lough And Machair/Trawalua/Mullaghmore SAC

To deal with the licence breaches works have been carried out on the site which were not covered in the original AA. Can you please confirm that a new AA has been or will be carried out for this licence on foot of the changed circumstances before any consideration is given to re-instating the licence and that the new AA will be subject to the appropriate public consultation. I presume, as the licence has been amended, that there would be a requirement for a new round of public participation.

Can you also confirm whether a DAFM ecologist has visited the site since the incident was reported.

In addition, based on Coillte's somewhat incredulous Report, there is relevant watercourse that was not identified originally and also an underground water source which had not previously been identified. These of themselves would necessitate a new AA.

"Root Cause:

The source of the problem appears to have come from a dry drain which started to carry water following a severe rainfall event on the weekend of 15th and 16th Oct. No operations had taken place since Friday 14th. A previously unknown underground water source would appear to have contributed to the issue which resulted in silt/sediment release into a 1st order tributary of the Black River (see Fig.2). At the time of activity commencement, it was not possible to identify the potential for this underground source of water which developed into an overland flow".

Also can you confirm if DAFM has had sight of Coillte's Contingency Plan? It was not provided to me with AIE Records.

██████████  
Disclaimer:

Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine

The information contained in this email and in any attachments is confidential and is designated solely for the attention and use of the intended recipient(s). This information may be subject to legal and professional privilege. If you are not an intended recipient of this email, you must not use, disclose, copy, distribute or retain this message or any part of it. If you have received this email in error, please notify the sender immediately and delete all copies of this email from your computer system(s).

An Roinn Talmhaíochta, Bia agus Mara

Tá an t-eolas sa ríomhphost seo, agus in aon cheangaltáin leis, faoi rún agus tá sé dírithe ar an bhfaighteoir/na faighteoirí beartaithe amháin agus níor cheart ach dóibh siúd é a úsáid. D'fhéadfadh an t-eolas seo a bheith faoi réir pribhléid dhlíthiúil agus ghairmiúil. Mura tusa faighteoir beartaithe an ríomhphost seo, níor cheart duit an teachtaireacht seo, nó aon chuid di, a úsáid, a nochtadh, a chóipeáil, a dháileadh nó a choinneáil. Má fuair tú an ríomhphost seo go hearráideach, cuir an seoltóir ar an eolas láithreach agus scríos gach cóip den ríomhphost seo ó chóra(i)s do ríomhaire, le do thoil.